<span id="page-0-0"></span>evaluating factors that influence the trajectory of aspects of QOL that are important to patients and ensuring clinical studies include outcomes that are important to patients and can measure meaningful changes with disease progression and clinical events.

# CONFLICT OF INTEREST STATEMENT

None declared.

(See related article by Grams et al. Clinical events and patientreported outcome measures during CKD progression: findings from the Chronic Renal Insufficiency Cohort Study. Nephrol Dial Transplant 2021; 36: 1685–1693)

#### FUNDING

A.T. is supported by a National Health and Medical Research Council Investigator Award (APP1197324109). H.J.M. is supported by a Royal Australian College of Physicians Jacquot Research Entry Scholarship. M.H. is supported by two National Health and Medical Research Grants (1125434 and 1199902).

# DATA AVAILABILITY STATEMENT

This publication includes no orignal data except those extracted from the cited publications.

## **REFERENCES**

- [1](#page--1-0). Porter AC, Lash JP, Xie D et al. Predictors and outcomes of health-related quality of life in adults with CKD. Clin J Am Soc Nephrol 2016; 11: 1154–1162
- [2](#page--1-0). Morton RL, Tong A, Howard K et al. The views of patients and carers in treatment decision making for chronic kidney disease: systematic review and thematic synthesis of qualitative studies. BMJ 2010; 340: c112
- [3.](#page--1-0) Pagels AA, Söderkvist BK, Medin C et al. Health-related quality of life in different stages of chronic kidney disease and at initiation of dialysis treatment. Health Qual Life Outcomes 18; 10: 71
- [4.](#page--1-0) Park JI, Baek H, Jung HH. CKD and health-related quality of life: the Korea National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey. Am J Kidney Dis 2016; 67: 851–860
- [5.](#page--1-0) Oh TR, Choi HS, Kim CS et al. Association between health related quality of life and progression of chronic kidney disease. Sci Rep 2019; 9: 19595
- [6.](#page--1-0) Grams ME, Surapaneni A, Appel L et al. Clinical events and patientreported outcome measures during CKD progression: findings from the CRIC Study. Nephrol Dial Transplant 2021; 36: 1685–1693
- [7.](#page--1-0) Mujais SK, Story K, Brouillette J et al. Health-related quality of life in CKD Patients: correlates and evolution over time. Clin J Am Soc Nephrol 2009; 4: 1293–1301
- [8.](#page--1-0) Wyld MLR, Morton RL, Clayton P et al. The impact of progressive chronic kidney disease on health-related quality-of-life: a 12-year community cohort study. Qual Life Res 2019; 28: 2081–2090
- [9.](#page--1-0) Gorodetskaya I, Zenios S, McCulloch CE et al. Health-related quality of life and estimates of utility in chronic kidney disease. Kidney Int 2005; 68: 2801–2808
- 10. Peipert JD, Bentler PM, Klicko K et al. Psychometric properties of the Kidney Disease Quality of Life 36-Item Short-Form Survey (KDQOL-36) in the United States. Am J Kidney Dis 2018; 71: 461–468
- 11. Ricardo AC, Hacker E, Lora CM et al. Validation of the Kidney Disease Quality of Life Short Form 36 (KDQOL-36) US Spanish and English versions in a cohort of Hispanics with chronic kidney disease. Ethn Dis 2013; 23: 202–209
- 12. Ware JE Jr, Richardson MM, Meyer KB et al. Improving CKD-specific patient-reported measures of health-related quality of life. J Am Soc Nephrol 2019; 30: 664–677
- [13.](#page--1-0) Meuleman Y, Chilcot J, Dekker FW et al. Health-related quality of life trajectories during predialysis care and associated illness perceptions. Health Psychol 2017; 36: 1083–1091
- [14.](#page--1-0) Modi GK, Yadav AK, Ghosh A et al. Nonmedical factors and health-related quality of life in CKD in India. Clin J Am Soc Nephrol 2020; 15: 191-199
- [15.](#page--1-0) Tong A, Levey AS, Eckardt KU et al. Patient and caregiver perspectives on terms used to describe kidney health. Clin J Am Soc Nephrol 2020; 15: 937–948

Received: 7.12.2020; Editorial decision: 6.1.2021

Nephrol Dial Transplant (2021) 36: 1565–1569 doi: 10.1093/ndt/gfab215 Advance Access publication 10 July 2021

# Nephrotic syndrome and vasculitis following SARS-CoV-2 vaccine: true association or circumstantial?

# Hassan Izzedine  $\bigcirc$ <sup>1</sup>, Marco Bonilla  $\bigcirc$ <sup>2</sup> and Kenar D. Jhaveri<sup>2,3</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Nephrology, Peupliers Private Hospital—Ramsay Générale de Santé, Paris, France, <sup>2</sup>Division of Kidney Diseases and Hypertension, Department of Medicine, Donald and Barbara Zucker School of Medicine at Hofstra/Northwell, Great Neck, NY, USA and <sup>3</sup>The Glomerular Disease Center at Northwell Health, Donald and Barbara Zucker School of Medicine at Hofstra/Northwell and Northwell Health, Great Neck, NY, USA

### Correspondence to: Kenar D. Jhaveri; E-mail: kjhaveri@northwell.edu

The immunologic response following several varieties of vaccination (especially meningococcal C conjugate vaccines) has been described as a potential trigger for the development of nephrotic syndrome (NS) [\[1,](#page-4-0) [2](#page-4-0)]. Coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) vaccine, administered worldwide, appears to be safe. However, rare reports of both de novo and recurrent NS and vasculitis are emerging.

Vaccines for the severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2) have been developed in an accelerated manner as a response to a pandemic. They use different

<span id="page-1-0"></span>

lone; DM, diabetes mellitus; HT, hypertension; VTE, venous thromboembolism; M, male, F, female; UPCR, urine protein–creatinine ratio; Pu, proteinuria; AI hepatitis, auto-immune hepatitis; NA, not available.

Downloaded from https://academic.oup.com/ndt/article/36/9/1565/6318785 by guest on 19 July 2022

<span id="page-2-0"></span>

Table 2. Crescentic glomerulonephritis following SARS-CoV-2 vaccine Table 2. Crescentic glomerulonephritis following SARS-CoV-2 vaccine

<span id="page-3-0"></span>mechanisms to generate immunity. Pfizer BNT162b2 and Moderna mRNA-1273 use a pioneer mechanism, a lipid nanoparticle nucleoside-modified mRNA that encodes SARS-CoV-2 spike (S) protein, which medicates host attachment and viral entry. AstraZeneca uses a replication-deficient chimpanzee adenovirus vector, containing the SARS-CoV-2 S protein. Studied subjects generated T cell response,  $CD8+$  and  $CD4+$  expansion, to a Th1-biased response with production of Interferon- $\gamma$ , tumor necrosis factor- $\alpha$  (TNF- $\alpha$ ), interleukin-2 and antibody (Ab) production predominantly of immunoglobulin G1 (IgG1) and IgG3 subclasses [\[3–5](#page-4-0)]. These immune responses might be associated with a recurrence of glomerular disease or as a possible trigger for podocytopathies.

To date, 11 NS [new onset (5 patients) and relapsed (6 patients)] linked to minimal change disease (MCD) (10 patients) or membranous nephropathy (1 patient) after SARS-CoV-2 vaccines—Pfizer BNT162b2 (4 patients, 3 patients), Moderna mRNA-1273 (1 patient, 0 patient), AstraZeneca (0 patient, 2 patients) or SINOVAC (0 patient, 1 patient) vaccine have been reported [\(Table 1](#page-1-0)) [[6–15\]](#page-4-0). All cases appeared 3 days to 2 weeks after the first vaccine dose followed by remission under corticosteroid treatment, except in one patient with underlying diabetic change nephropathy [[7\]](#page-4-0).

As of this date, there are six cases of de novo crescentic glomerulonephritis after the SARS-CoV-2 vaccines—[Pfizer BNT162b2 (2 patients), Moderna mRNA-1273 (4 patients)] de-scribed in the literature [\(Table 2\)](#page-2-0) [\[16–19](#page-4-0)]. Two patients had a past medical history significant for hypertension. Kidney biopsies showed anti-neutrophil cytoplasmic antibodies (ANCA) associated vasculitis (Moderna mRNA-1273), IgA nephritis (Pfizer BNT162b2, Moderna mRNA-1273) and antiglomerular basement membrane (anti-GBM) disease (Pfizer BNT162b2, Moderna mRNA-1273), respectively, each 2 patients. All patients were treated with corticosteroids and cyclophosphamide. Three and one patients required plasma exchange and rituximab, respectively. Two patients had improvement of symptoms and two remained in hemodialysis [\(Table 2\)](#page-2-0) [[16–19\]](#page-4-0).

Vaccination (notably influenza) is a recognized trigger for the relapse of idiopathic NS [[16](#page-4-0)] and ANCA-associated vasculitis [[17\]](#page-4-0). Acute onset of MCD has been reported at 4 and 18 days following the influenza vaccine [\[1,](#page-4-0) [18](#page-4-0)] and 6 weeks following a tetanus–diphtheria–poliomyelitis vaccination [\[20,](#page-4-0) [21,](#page-4-0) [22](#page-4-0)]. The association between the timing of vaccination and the development of both new onset and relapsed MCD and/or membranous nephropathy raises questions as to the mechanisms involved. The strong temporal association with vaccination and MCD cases suggests a more generalized cytokine-mediated response [\[23\]](#page-4-0) and/or a rapid T cell-mediated immune response to viral mRNA as a possible trigger for podocytopathy [\[13,](#page-4-0) [24\]](#page-4-0). The Pfizer–BioNTech vaccine is reported to induce robust T cell activation, as previously described, which might contribute to MCD. It is also possible that these phenomena are completely circumstantial and unrelated. Regardless, prompt initiation of steroid treatment should be considered. S protein data were not reported in most of the cases to raise the timing of the formation of the Ab and the glomerular disease finding. Is this more common than for the influenza vaccine? This cannot be answered at this moment as mass vaccination leads to clustering of rare side effects and true incidence is hard to define.

The mechanism of de novo ANCA-associated vasculitis post-SARS-CoV-2 vaccine remains to be elucidated but the temporal association suggests a neutrophilic immune response to the S protein or mRNA of SARS-CoV-2 in predisposed individuals. It is possible that the vaccines lead to proinflammatory cytokines such as TNF and interleukin-1B, which can prime neutrophils leading to formation of neutrophil extracellular traps (NETs). Persistent NETs and prolonged exposure to their contents can lead to disruption of tolerance and formation of Abs to myeloperoxidase and proteinase 3. This could be the mechanism of triggering an ANCA-associated vasculitis [\[25](#page-4-0)]. However, crescents may take time to form, suggesting an unrecognized underlying pre-existing glomerulonephritis was present at the time of receiving SARS-CoV-2 vaccination, which more likely potentiated an immune response in the described patients. In addition, there is a seasonal variation of vasculitis that may be playing a role here as well [\[26\]](#page-4-0), and not all related to the vaccine.

Reports of temporal and spatial clustering suggest that environmental factors such as infections may play a role in anti-GBM disease induction [\[27,](#page-4-0) [28\]](#page-4-0). Infectious associations, particularly with influenza A [[29,](#page-4-0) [30\]](#page-4-0), and high prevalence of prodromal upper and lower respiratory tract infection in a cohort of 140 Chinese patients [\[31\]](#page-4-0) may account for the aforementioned seasonal or geographic 'clustering' of anti-GBM disease cases.

COVID-19 may be one such infection [\[32,](#page-4-0) [33\]](#page-4-0), as suggested by a report of a cluster of cases in London during the current pandemic [\[34](#page-4-0)] with a 5-fold increased incidence. Although five of eight tested patients presenting with anti-GBM Ab were negative for SARS-CoV-2 infection by PCR, four had IgM and/or IgG Abs to SARS-CoV-2 S protein, raising the possibility that immune response to SARS-CoV-2 could be related to development of anti-GBM in some patients [\[34\]](#page-4-0).

However, there is no anti-GBM case following vaccination reported in the literature. Therefore, one can ask the question about the seasonality of anti-GBM Ab and/or the possibility that these patients were already infected with COVID-19, since none of the patients reported had a serological test before vaccination. Whether current cases can be attributed to SARS-CoV-2 vaccine-related immune response warrants investigation.

Pharmacovigilance of SARS-CoV-2 vaccines will be important to determine the incidence of these potential adverse events since many millions of doses of the various available SARS-CoV-2 vaccines have been administered worldwide. However, we also should be mindful that this may be a coincidence and not causation, and vaccinations should be continued in order to end the pandemic.

# CONFLICT OF INTEREST STATEMENT

K.D.J. is a consultant for Astex Pharmaceuticals, Natera, GlaxoSmithKline, ChemoCentryx and Chinook, a paid contributor to Uptodate.com and receives honorarium from the International Society for Nephrology and the American Society for Nephrology.

# Downloaded from https://academic.oup.com/ndt/article/36/9/1565/6318785 by guest on 19 July 2022 Downloaded from https://academic.oup.com/ndt/article/36/9/1565/6318785 by guest on 19 July 2022

# <span id="page-4-0"></span>**REFERENCES**

- [1](#page-0-0). Gutiérrez S, Dotto B, Petiti JP et al. Minimal change disease following influenza vaccination and acute renal failure: just a coincidence? Nefrologia 2012; 32: 414–415
- [2](#page-0-0). Abeyagunawardena A, Goldblatt D, Andrews N et al. Risk of relapse after meningococcal C conjugate vaccine in nephrotic syndrome. Lancet 2003; 362: 449–450
- 3. Sahin U, Muik A, Derhovanessian E et al. COVID-19 vaccine BNT162b1 elicits human antibody and TH1 T cell responses. Nature 2020; 586: 594–599
- 4. Jackson LA, Anderson EJ, Rouphael NG et al. An mRNA vaccine against SARS-CoV-2—preliminary report. N Engl J Med 2020; 383: 1920–1931
- 5. Ewer KJ, Barrett JR, Belij-Rammerstorfer S et al.; Oxford COVID Vaccine Trial Group. T cell and antibody responses induced by a single dose of ChAdOx1 nCoV-19 (AZD1222) vaccine in a phase 1/2 clinical trial. Nat Med 2021; 27: 270–278
- [6](#page-1-0). Lebedev L, Sapojnikov M, Wechsler A et al. Minimal change disease following the Pfizer–BioNTech COVID-19 vaccine. Am J Kidney Dis 2021; S0272-6386(21)00509-6; doi: 10.1053/j.ajkd.2021.03.010
- [7](#page-1-0). D'Agati VD, Kudose S, Bomback AS et al. Minimal change disease and acute kidney injury following the Pfizer–BioNTech COVID-19 vaccine. Kidney Int 2021; S0085-2538(21)00493-2; doi: 10.1016/j.kint.2021.04.035
- [8](#page-1-0). Maas RJ, Gianotten S, van der Meijden WAG. An additional case of minimal change disease following the Pfizer–BioNTech COVID-19 vaccine. Am J Kidney Dis 2021 (online ahead of print)
- [9](#page-1-0). Weijers J, Alvarez C, Hermans MMH. Post-vaccinal minimal change disease. Kidney Int 2021; doi: 10.1016/j.kint.2021.06.004 (online ahead of print)
- [10](#page-1-0). Kervella D, Jacquemont L, Chapelet-Debout A et al. Minimal change disease relapse following SARS-CoV-2 mRNA vaccine. Kidney Int 2021; S0085-2538(21)00478-6; doi: 10.1016/j.kint.2021.04.033
- [11](#page-1-0). Schwotzer N, Kissling S, Fakhouri F. Letter regarding "Minimal change disease relapse following SARS-CoV-2 mRNA vaccine". Kidney Int 2021; S0085-2538(21)00500-7; doi: 10.1016/j.kint.2021.05.006
- [12](#page-1-0). Komaba H, Wada T, Fukagawa M. Relapse of minimal change disease following the Pfizer–BioNTech COVID-19 vaccine. Am J Kidney Dis 2021; S0272-6386(21)00627-2; doi: 10.1053/j.ajkd.2021.05.006
- [13](#page-1-0). Morlidge C, El-Kateb S, Jeevaratnam P et al. Relapse of minimal change disease following the AstraZeneca COVID-19 vaccine. Kidney Int 2021; doi: 10.1016/j.kint.2021.06.005
- [14](#page-1-0). Holzworth A, Couchot P, Cruz-Knight W et al. Minimal change disease following the Moderna mRNA-1273 SARS-CoV-2 vaccine. Kidney Int 2021; S0085-2538(21)00501-9; doi: 10.1016/j.kint.2021.05.007
- [15](#page-1-0). Aydın MF, Yıldız A, Oruç A et al. Relapse of primary membranous nephropathy after inactivated SARS-CoV-2 virus vaccination. Kidney Int 2021; S0085-2538(21)00494-4; doi: 10.1016/j.kint.2021.05.001
- [16](#page-2-0). Anderegg MA, Liu M, Saganas C et al. De novo vasculitis after mRNA-1273 (Moderna) vaccination. Kidney Int 2021; S0085-2538(21)00554-8; doi: 10.1016/j.kint.2021.05.016
- [17.](#page-2-0) Sekar A, Campbell R, Tabbara J et al. ANCA glomerulonephritis post Moderna COVID-19 vaccination. Kidney Int 2021; S0085-2538(21)00555-X; doi: 10.1016/j.kint.2021.05.017
- [18.](#page-2-0) Sacker A, Kung V, Andeen N. Anti-GBM nephritis with mesangial IgA deposits after SARS-CoV-2 mRNA vaccination. Kidney Int 2021; doi: 10.1016/j.kint.2021.06.006
- [19.](#page-2-0) Tan HZ, Tan RY, Choo JCJ et al. Is COVID-19 vaccination unmasking glomerulonephritis? Kidney Int 2021; doi: 10.1016/j.kint.2021.05.009
- [20.](#page-3-0) Banerjee S, Dissanayake PV, Abeyagunawardena AS. Vaccinations in children on immunosuppressive medications for renal disease. Pediatr Nephrol 2016; 31: 1437–1448
- [21.](#page-3-0) Toru W. Vasculitis following influenza vaccination: A review of the literature. Curr Rheumatol Rev 2017; 13: 188–196
- [22.](#page-3-0) Clajus C, Spiegel J, Bröcker V et al. Minimal change nephrotic syndrome in an 82 year old patient following a tetanus–diphteria–poliomyelitis vaccination. BMC Nephrol 2009; 10: 21
- [23.](#page-3-0) Sette A, Crotty S. Adaptive immunity to SARS-CoV-2 and COVID-19. Cell 2021; 184: 861–880
- [24.](#page-3-0) Kielstein JT, Termühlen L, Sohn J et al. Minimal change nephrotic syndrome in a 65-year-old patient following influenza vaccination. Clin Nephrol 2000; 54: 246–248
- [25.](#page-3-0) Nakazawa D, Masuda S, Tomaru U et al. Pathogenesis and therapeutic interventions for ANCA-associated vasculitis. Nat Rev Rheumatol 2019; 15: 91–101
- [26.](#page-3-0) Draibe J, Rodo X, Fulladosa X et al.; Grupo de Malalties Glomerulars de la Societat Catalana de Nefrologia (GLOMCAT). Seasonal variations in the onset of positive and negative renal ANCA-associated vasculitis in Spain. Clin Kidney J 2018; 11: 468–473
- [27.](#page-3-0) Canney M, O'Hara PV, McEvoy CM et al. Spatial and temporal clustering of anti-glomerular basement membrane disease. Clin J Am Soc Nephrol 2016; 11: 1392–1399
- [28.](#page-3-0) McAdoo SP, Pusey CD. Clustering of anti-GBM disease: Clues to an environmental trigger? Clin J Am Soc Nephrol 2016; 11: 1324–1326
- [29.](#page-3-0) Perez GO, Bjornsson S, Ross AH et al. A miniepidemic of Goodpasture's syndrome clinical and immunological studies. Nephron 1974; 13: 161–173
- [30.](#page-3-0) Wilson CB, Smith RC. Goodpasture's syndrome associated with influenza A2 virus infection. Ann Intern Med 1972; 76: 91–94
- [31.](#page-3-0) Gu QH, Xie LJ, Jia XY et al. Fever and prodromal infections in anti-glomerular basement membrane disease. Nephrology (Carlton) 2018; 23: 476–482
- [32.](#page-3-0) Winkler A, Zitt E, Sprenger-Mähr H et al. SARS-CoV-2 infection and recurrence of anti-glomerular basement disease: A case report. BMC Nephrol 2021; 22: 75
- [33.](#page-3-0) Nahhal S, Halawi A, Basma H Sr et al. Anti-glomerular basement membrane disease as a potential complication of COVID-19: A case report and review of literature. Cureus 2020; 12: e12089
- [34.](#page-3-0) Prendecki M, Clarke C, Cairns T et al. Anti-glomerular basement membrane disease during the COVID-19 pandemic. Kidney Int 2020; 98: 780–781

Received: 15.6.2021; Editorial decision: 4.7.2021